

CLASSIFICATION & COMPENSATION STUDY

TOWN OF ORANGE, MA

SEPTEMBER 2023

Edward J. Collins, Jr. Center for Public Management

McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES

Contents

Executive Summary	3
Position Descriptions	3
Rating of Positions for Classification & Internal Equity	3
Market Salary Survey	5
Development of the Salary Schedule	6
Implementation	7
Recommended Title Changes and Standardization	8
Summary of Market Survey Maximum FY23	10
Sample Step System with 15 steps with 2% increments.....	13

Executive Summary

The Town of Orange retained the Edward J. Collins, Jr. Center for Public Management (Collins Center) to conduct a classification and compensation study. The Collins Center analyzed selected municipal positions and achieved the following:

- Developed new position descriptions for the positions studied, which include clear definitions of essential functions and requirements.
- Evaluated and assigned all positions studied to classification grades to ensure internal equity.
- Evaluated survey data and recommended a compensation structure.

Position Descriptions

The Collins Center started with an evaluation of the Town's current classification system. In order to facilitate this evaluation, the Town made available existing copies of positions descriptions. Position classification questionnaires (questionnaires) were distributed to incumbent employees. The questionnaires elicit information including but not limited to the nature of the work performed, the complexity and scope of responsibilities and the requirements needed to fill the position, if vacant.

After the collection of completed questionnaires interviews were conducted with employees to learn more about the positions. The information gathered through the questionnaires, interviews and discussion with department managers was coalesced in the development of draft of position descriptions. The drafts were submitted to the Town for distribution to employees and supervisors for comments. The draft position descriptions are provided electronically under separate cover.

Rating of Positions for Classification & Internal Equity

Once descriptions were drafted, the Collins Center used a point factor rating method to objectively evaluate the positions. The application of an objective position evaluation system that is consistently applied to each position is critical in assuring the internal equity of the classification plan. The evaluation system utilized by the Collins Center is one that has been successfully implemented in many municipalities and other governmental organizations in the Commonwealth. Each position was assigned a point factor in a series of categories, including those listed below, and the total points were used to determine the groupings of positions. These categories include:

Supervision Received	Supervision Exercised	Accountability
Judgement	Complexity	Personal Contacts
Confidentiality	Education/Licenses	Experience
Work Environment	Physical Requirements	Motor Skills
Physical Skills	Occupational Risks	

While the classification structure of the Town positions was found to be fairly accurate, position descriptions needed to be updated to reflect the current duties. Having a comprehensive updated classification system will benefit the Town in recruitment efforts and in efforts to conduct comparisons to other municipalities for compensation.

The Collins Center recommends the Town change a number of position titles. Orange has created unique titles that are not industry standard. For example "highly skilled" and "professional" are not typically used and do not clearly describe the level of the position. Position descriptions and classification grades should

have consistent license and certification requirement. Additionally, the Collins Center recommends standardizing administrative and clerical titles across departments that correspond to the assigned classification grades. The following Table is the recommended classification structure, reflecting the recommended titles. Attached to this Report is a Table detailing the existing titles and the recommended standardized titles.

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
A1	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Cemetery, Parks & Highway Superintendent
B	Airport	Airport Manager
	Building	Building Commissioner
	Community Development & Planning	Community Development & Planning Director
	Accounting	Town Accountant
	Finance -Treasurer	Treasurer
	Health	Health Director
	Library	Library Director
	Sewer/Wastewater	Sewer/Wastewater Superintendent
	Water	Water Superintendent
C	Council on Aging	COA Director
	Sewer/Wastewater	Assistant Superintendent
	Town Administrator/BOS	Assistant Town Administrator
	Town Clerk	Town Clerk
	Town Collector	Town Collector
	Transfer Station	Manager
D	Town Administrator/BOS	Executive Assistant
	Building/Health	Office Manager
	Community Development & Planning	Assistant Town Planner
	Finance - Treasurer/HR	Assistant Treasurer/HR Specialist
	Town Clerk	Assistant Town Clerk
	Library	Assistant Library Director/Children's Librarian
	Building	Inspector of Wires
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Working Foreperson/HEO-Cemetery/Parks
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Working Foreperson/HEO-Highway
	Water	Working Foreperson/HEO - Water
	Sewer/Wastewater	Operator/Laboratory Technician
E	Police	Administrative Assistant
	Airport	Airport Lineperson
	Finance	Assistant Accountant/Tax Collector Clerk
	Library	Head of Adult and Building Services
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Heavy Equipment Operator/Laborer
	Transfer Station	Heavy Equipment Operator/Laborer
	Water Department	Water Operator/HEO
F	Assessor	Department Assistant Assessor
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Department Assistant -Various
	Council on Aging	Department Assistant – COA
	Finance - Treasurer	Department Assistant - Treasurer
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Motor Equipment Operator/Laborer
	Water Department	Water Operator/MEO

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
G	Library	Library Assistant
	Sewer/Wastewater	Operator in Training/Laborer- Sewer/WW
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Laborer
	Transfer Station	Laborer/Recycling/Sanitation Attendant
	Water Department	Operator in Training/Laborer – Water
H	Library	Library Aide

The Collins Center updated the Police and Fire Department position descriptions. With public safety, the classification or grade of a position is determined by the rank and title of the position. The following Table represents the classification structure for public safety positions.

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
F0	Fire	Fire Chief
F1	Fire	Fire Captain
F3	Fire	Firefighter/EMT
F4	Fire	Firefighter
P0	Police	Police Chief
P1	Police	Police Lieutenant
P2	Police	Police Sergeant
P3	Police	Police Officer

Market Salary Survey

Not all municipalities have the same titles or definitions of duties under a specific title, which can make exact comparisons difficult. The following municipalities were used in the analysis of market salary data: Ashburnham, Athol, Barre, Belchertown, Deerfield, Erving, Greenfield, Hubbardston, Montague, New Salem, Northfield, Sunderland, Templeton, Warwick, Wendell, and Winchendon.

The Collins Center evaluated hourly rates to ensure accurate comparisons. As with Orange, many municipalities have varying hours for positions across titles and departments. Some municipalities have 40 hour work weeks, others have 37.5, 35 or 32. Using an hourly rate equalizes the data for the purpose of comparison.

The Collins Center evaluates both the average and the median pay in order to obtain accurate information, as the analysis of median pay helps to mitigate outlying data points. The following Table highlights some of the challenges when reviewing survey data and should be taken into consideration when making evaluative determinations.

FACTOR	DISCUSSION
Title Comparison	A survey of titles can be challenging. Oftentimes, the same title in another municipality may have different levels of responsibility, which can skew the results.
Data Points	The Center provided analysis with three data points or greater. Using fewer than three data points can have a skewed average and median and is not mathematically accurate.

FACTOR	DISCUSSION
Organizational/Staffing Structure	Staffing levels and classification structures can impact salary survey results. For example, a large municipality may have more positions, which may be specialized, or have narrow responsibilities, whereas a smaller municipality, with fewer staff, may have broader responsibilities within a title.
Elected and Appointed Officials	It is common for appointed officials with the same title as elected officials to be compensated at a higher level because of the professional education and experience required to be hired into the position. Elected officials do not have the minimum requirements and as such are oftentimes paid differently than their counterpart in other municipalities.
Reporting Relationship	Depending on the municipality and organizational structure, titles may not be truly comparable. In larger municipalities, the same title can be a department head, division head, or professional staff. Example: Planner
Salary Ranges	It is common for salary ranges to be outdated, which contributes to data being skewed. Even though many municipalities report minimum salary ranges, it is not known if they actually hire or compensate employees at the minimum.

The Town has positions with salary ranges and others with a single pay. Having a system without a range can contribute to incumbents falling behind in the labor market. In Orange, the positions with salary ranges, the range is a spread of approximately 10% to 12% depending on the title. The industry standard for salary ranges is 25% to 30%.

A summary of the survey is attached to this report. Because many of the responding municipalities either did not have minimum rates of pay or did not have similar titles, the Collins Center evaluated the survey maximum rates. The market survey summary reflects the amount the rates are below the maximum, however, that does not mean the position is not within the market ranges. If the standard range of 25% to 30% is applied, almost all positions are determined to be within the labor market. It should be noted the survey was completed with FY23 data for the Town and the survey municipalities.

Development of the Salary Schedule

In classification evaluation, it is important to note that each municipality is different and the comparability within an organization is as important, if not more so, than external comparability. In developing the recommended salary schedule, the Collins Center coalesced the data from classification groupings and the market survey to establish salary ranges for each of the grades. The salary ranges were established by evaluating the median and average maximum pay of the survey data pay with respect to the existing pay of the positions in each grade. The following table represents the Collins Center's recommendations for ranges by classification using a 30% range.

Grade	Recommended Minimum	Recommended Maximum
A	\$38.46	\$50.00
B	\$34.62	\$45.00
C	\$26.92	\$35.00
D	\$23.08	\$30.00
E	\$19.23	\$25.00
F	\$17.69	\$23.00
G	\$16.15	\$21.00
H	\$14.62	\$19.00

The Collins Center recommends the following ranges for the Fire and Police Departments.

GRADE	TITLE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
F0	Fire Chief	\$40.00	\$45.00
F1	Fire Captain	\$22.00	\$27.00
F3	Firefighter/EMT	\$20.00	\$25.00
F4	Firefighter	\$18.00	\$23.00
P0	Police Chief	\$48.00	\$52.00
P1	Police Lieutenant	\$40.00	\$45.00
P2	Police Sergeant	\$31.00	\$36.00
P3	Police Officer	\$25.00	\$30.00

Implementation

The Town will need to make policy decisions on any other adjustments such as length of service in position and applying across the board or COLA to the entire pay scale. The Town could consider adopting a step system, an open range or a quadrant system. The Collins Center is happy to assist the Town with this task.

In considering the implementation of the recommendations, the Town will need to determine how best to implement the recommended ranges. A common methodology is to create a step system. With a range of 30%, most municipalities adopt a step system with 15 step with a spread of 2% between the steps. Employees are then placed on the step that provides for an increase. Additionally, municipalities often take into consideration years of service in position when placing an employee on a step. For example an employee with 20 years in a position, may be granted the initial placement, plus 3 steps; an employee with 15 years of service in a position, may be granted the initial placement, plus 2 steps; and an employee with 10 years of service in a position, may be granted the initial placement, plus 1 step. A sample pay scale with 15 steps is attached.

Typically, newly created pay scales are adopted on a fiscal year and step increases are granted on an annual basis, which enables budgeting for them as level service. Oftentimes step increases are tied to a satisfactory performance evaluation.

Most municipalities adjust the entire scale on an annual or biannual basis, granting across the board adjustments, sometimes tied to the Consumer Price Index. Doing so increases the entire scale. As noted above, the survey data and the Orange salaries used for analysis are FY23 figures. The Town will need to take that into consideration when approaching implementation.

To address employees who may be at the maximum, many municipalities adopt a longevity policy that grants certain amounts of an annual longevity stipend after a certain year of service. The most common methodology is to have longevity stipends start when a person reaches 10 or 15 years of service.

Conclusion

The Collins Center would like to thank the Town for welcoming the Collins Center. We believe the recommended position descriptions, classification, and compensation plan will serve the Town well for many years to come.

Recommended Title Changes and Standardization

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	EXISTING TITLE	RECOMMENDED TITLE
A	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Superintendent- Cemeteries, Parks, Highway	
B	Airport	Airport Manager	
	Building Department	Building Inspector	
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Superintendent- Cemeteries, Parks, Highway	
	Community Development & Planning	Director of Community Development & Planning	
	Finance	Town Accountant	
	Finance	Treasurer	
	Health	Health Agent	Health Director
	Library	Library Director	
	Sewer/Wastewater	Sewer Superintendent	
	Water Department	Water Superintendent	
C	Building Department	Inspector of Wires	
	Council on Aging	COA Director	
	Sewer/Wastewater	Assistant Sewer Superintendent	
	Town Administrator/BOS	Assistant Town Administrator	
	Town Clerk	Town Clerk	
	Town Collector	Town Collector	
	Transfer Station	Sanitation Manager	
D	Town Administrator/BOS	Administrative Assistant	Executive Assistant
	Building Department/BOH	Administrative Assistant	Office Manager
	Community Development & Planning	Assistant Town Planner	
	Finance - Treasurer/HR	Assistant Treasurer/Human Resources Specialist	
	Town Clerk	Assistant Town Clerk	
	Library	Assistant Library Director/Children's Librarian	
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Working Foreman-Cemetery/Parks	Working Foreperson - Cemetery/Parks
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Working Foreman-Highway	Working Foreperson- Highway

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	EXISTING TITLE	RECOMMENDED TITLE
	Water Department	Professional Working Foreman/Water	Working Foreperson- Water
	Sewer/Wastewater	WW Operator/Laboratory Technician	
E	Police	Administrative Assistant	
	Airport	Airport Lineman	Airport Lineperson
	Finance	Assistant Accountant/Tax Collector Clerk	
	Library	Head of Adult Library	
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Highly Skilled Laborer-Highway	Heavy Equipment Operator/Laborer
	Transfer Station	Laborer/Truck Driver/Equipment Operator	Heavy Equipment Operator/Laborer
	Water Department	Professional Secondary Water Operator-Full	Water Operator - HEO
F	Assessors	Assessors Clerk/Administrative Assistant	Department Assistant
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Administrative Assistant HWY/Water/Sewer	Department Assistant
	Council on Aging	Administrative Assistant	Department Assistant
	Finance	Treasurer Clerk	Department Assistant
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	Skilled Laborer-Highway	Motor Equipment Operator
	Water Department	Professional Water Operator	Water Operator /MEO
G	Library	Children's Library Assistant	Library Assistant
	Library	Adult Library Assistant	Library Assistant
	Sewer/Wastewater	Skilled Laborer/Operator in Training	Laborer
	Cemetery, Parks, Highway	General Laborer	Laborer
	Transfer Station	Recycling Center/Transfer Station Attendant	Laborer Recycling Sanitation Attendant
	Water Department	Professional Secondary Water Op-In Training	Water Operator in Training/Laborer
H	Library	Interlibrary Loan Assistant	Library Aide
	Library	Children's Library Aide	Library Aide

Summary of Market Survey Maximum FY23

EXISTING TITLE	ORANGE MINIMUM HOURLY RATE	ORANGE MAXIMUM HOURLY RATE	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM
Town Administrator/Treasurer		\$34.87	\$49.18	\$49.08	(\$14.31)	(\$14.21)
Superintendent- Cemeteries, Parks, Highway		\$39.86	\$45.70	\$45.43	(\$5.84)	(\$5.57)
Airport Manager		\$37.41				
Building Inspector		\$36.68	\$36.84	\$36.06	(\$0.16)	\$0.62
Superintendent- Cemeteries, Parks, Highway		\$39.86	\$45.70	\$45.43	(\$5.84)	(\$5.57)
Town Accountant		\$36.68	\$53.85	\$46.11	(\$17.17)	(\$9.43)
Treasurer		\$24.69	\$39.21	\$39.41	(\$14.52)	(\$14.72)
Health Agent		\$32.16	\$36.90	\$37.70	(\$4.74)	(\$5.54)
Library Director		\$30.69	\$36.63	\$35.43	(\$5.94)	(\$4.74)
Director of Community Development		\$33.67	\$42.24	\$45.01	(\$8.57)	(\$11.34)
Sewer Superintendent		\$37.91	\$40.10	\$39.48	(\$2.19)	(\$1.57)
Water Superintendent		\$41.23				
Inspector of Wires		\$28.00				
COA Director		\$20.82	\$34.74	\$35.32	(\$13.92)	(\$14.50)
Assistant Sewer Superintendent		\$33.56	\$31.71	\$30.16	\$1.85	\$3.41
Town Clerk		\$25.45	\$35.75	\$34.39	(\$10.30)	(\$8.94)
Town Collector		\$24.69	\$33.18	\$33.52	(\$8.49)	(\$8.83)
Assistant Town Administrator		\$22.00				
Sanitation Manager		\$26.86	\$26.74	\$27.92	\$0.12	(\$1.06)
Administrative Assistant	\$19.69	\$21.74	\$26.49	\$26.81	(\$4.75)	(\$5.07)
Working Foreman-Highway	\$20.67	\$23.23	\$33.81	\$34.37	(\$10.58)	(\$11.14)
Working Foreman-Cemetery/Parks	\$20.39	\$22.96	\$33.35	\$33.04	(\$10.39)	(\$10.08)
Assistant Treasurer/Human Resources Specialist		\$22.56	\$27.82	\$27.13	(\$5.26)	(\$4.57)
Children's Librarian/Assistant Library Director		\$24.40	\$29.81	\$30.95	(\$5.41)	(\$6.55)
Planning Technician		\$25.19				
Assistant Town Planner		\$23.97				
Operator/Laboratory Technician	\$20.96	\$23.53	\$29.19	\$24.70	(\$5.66)	(\$1.17)

EXISTING TITLE	ORANGE MINIMUM HOURLY RATE	ORANGE MAXIMUM HOURLY RATE	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM
Assistant Town Clerk		\$17.73	\$26.81	\$27.03	(\$9.08)	(\$9.30)
Professional Working Foreman/Water	\$20.96	\$23.53				
Airport Lineperson		\$15.70				
Highly Skilled Laborer-Highway	\$18.95	\$21.34	\$25.50	\$25.34	(\$4.16)	(\$4.00)
Assistant Accountant/Tax Collector Clerk	\$15.63	\$17.25	\$26.40	\$26.63	(\$9.15)	(\$9.38)
Head of Adult Library	\$19.69	\$21.74	\$26.32	\$26.95	(\$4.58)	(\$5.21)
Administrative Assistant		\$19.56	\$26.84	\$26.48	(\$7.28)	(\$6.92)
Laborer/Truck Driver/Equipment Operator	\$18.03	\$20.30				
Professional Water Operator	\$19.54	\$21.92				
Professional Secondary Water Operator-Full status	\$19.27	\$21.70				
Assessors Clerk/Administrative Assistant		\$20.71	\$24.74	\$24.23	(\$4.03)	(\$3.52)
Skilled Laborer-Highway	\$18.03	\$20.30	\$24.39	\$24.46	(\$4.09)	(\$4.16)
Administrative Assistant HWY/Water/Sewer	\$16.87	\$18.64	\$25.88	\$24.53	(\$7.24)	(\$5.89)
Administrative Assistant	\$19.69	\$21.74	\$25.17	\$23.48	(\$3.43)	(\$1.74)
Treasurer Clerk			\$23.21	\$22.18		
General Laborer	\$16.16	\$18.19	\$20.92	\$20.58	(\$2.73)	(\$2.39)
Children's Library Assistant	\$16.87	\$18.64	\$21.73	\$22.18	(\$3.09)	(\$3.54)
Adult Library Assistant	\$14.47	\$15.97	\$21.58	\$20.00	(\$5.61)	(\$4.03)
Skilled Laborer/Operator in Training	\$18.03	\$20.30	\$23.09	\$23.29	(\$2.79)	(\$2.99)
Recycling Center/Transfer Station Attendant	\$18.03	\$20.30	\$20.04	\$20.14	\$0.26	\$0.16
Professional Secondary Water Op-In Training	\$18.95	\$21.34				
Interlibrary Loan Assistant	\$15.63	\$17.25			\$17.25	\$17.25
Children's Library Aide	\$12.40	\$13.69				
Fire Chief		\$42.47	\$41.37	\$39.57	\$1.10	\$2.90
Fire Captain I	\$19.67	\$23.10				
Firefighter/EMT		\$21.08	\$26.30	\$26.40	(\$5.22)	(\$5.32)
Firefighter	\$18.56	\$21.80	\$23.37	\$23.25	(\$1.57)	(\$1.45)
Entry/Probationary Firefighter	\$18.01	\$21.16				

EXISTING TITLE	ORANGE MINIMUM HOURLY RATE	ORANGE MAXIMUM HOURLY RATE	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	ORANGE MAXIMUM MINUS SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM
Police Chief		\$50.38	\$48.67	\$46.24	\$1.71	\$4.15
Police Lieutenant		\$41.57	\$48.11	\$47.87	(\$6.54)	(\$6.30)
Police Sergeant		\$35.93	\$31.62	\$32.41	\$4.31	\$3.53
Police Officer		\$28.75	\$29.74	\$29.32	(\$0.99)	(\$0.57)

**Note: Public Safety survey comparisons may be skewed by factors such as educational incentive, shift differentials and holiday pay. The Town should evaluate the source data for accurate analysis.*

Sample Step System with 15 steps with 2% increments

GRADE/ STEP	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
A	\$38.46	\$39.23	\$40.01	\$40.81	\$41.63	\$42.46	\$43.31	\$44.18	\$45.06	\$45.96	\$46.88	\$47.82	\$48.78	\$49.76	\$50.76
B	\$34.62	\$35.31	\$36.02	\$36.74	\$37.47	\$38.22	\$38.98	\$39.76	\$40.56	\$41.37	\$42.20	\$43.04	\$43.90	\$44.78	\$45.68
C	\$26.92	\$27.46	\$28.01	\$28.57	\$29.14	\$29.72	\$30.31	\$30.92	\$31.54	\$32.17	\$32.81	\$33.47	\$34.14	\$34.82	\$35.52
D	\$23.08	\$23.54	\$24.01	\$24.49	\$24.98	\$25.48	\$25.99	\$26.51	\$27.04	\$27.58	\$28.13	\$28.69	\$29.26	\$29.85	\$30.45
E	\$19.23	\$19.62	\$20.01	\$20.41	\$20.82	\$21.24	\$21.66	\$22.09	\$22.53	\$22.98	\$23.44	\$23.91	\$24.39	\$24.88	\$25.38
F	\$17.69	\$18.05	\$18.41	\$18.78	\$19.16	\$19.54	\$19.93	\$20.33	\$20.74	\$21.15	\$21.57	\$22.00	\$22.44	\$22.89	\$23.35
G	\$16.15	\$16.48	\$16.81	\$17.15	\$17.49	\$17.84	\$18.20	\$18.56	\$18.93	\$19.31	\$19.70	\$20.09	\$20.49	\$20.90	\$21.32
H	\$14.62	\$14.91	\$15.21	\$15.51	\$15.82	\$16.14	\$16.46	\$16.79	\$17.13	\$17.47	\$17.82	\$18.18	\$18.54	\$18.91	\$19.29